



MINUTES No. 29
of the session of the Advisory Group of Experts

The session was held in remote mode using electronic video-conference means

August 7, 2026

Beginning of the session: 17:00

End of the session: 17:22

Members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:

Oksana Vasylychenko, Aleš Zalar, Vasyl Shakun, Maureen O'Connor, Yaroslav Romaniuk, Hanna Suchocka

Deputy members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:

Volodymyr Kuzmenko, Thomas Griffith, Vitalii Makhinchuk, Marek Zubik

Proposed agenda:

1. On adopting decisions on the assessment of compliance of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of high moral qualities.

- 1.1. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Rasim Babanly with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.2. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Klymenko with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.3. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Klymenko with the criterion of high moral qualities.



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

- 1.4. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Kravchuk with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.5. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Olesia Nykon with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.6. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Vitalii Prydatko with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.7. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Andrii Savchak with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.8. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Petro Saliuk with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.9. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Mykhailo Smokovych with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.10. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Solotkyi with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.11. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Sotnikov with the criterion of high moral qualities.
- 1.12. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Tsmokalenko with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

In total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: to approve the proposed agenda.

Consideration of the agenda items:

1. On adopting decisions on the assessment of compliance of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

1.1. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Rasim Babanly with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Rasim Babanly as compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O'Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

In total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Rasim Babanly, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

- 1.2. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Klymenko with the criterion of high moral qualities



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Klymenko as compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Klymenko, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.3. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Klymenko with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Klymenko as compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Klymenko, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.4. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Kravchuk with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Kravchuk as compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oleksii Kravchuk, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.5. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Olesia Nykon with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Olesia Nykon as non-compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "AGAINST"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "AGAINST"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "AGAINST"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 3 votes, "AGAINST" – 3 votes.



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Decided: under paragraph two of Item 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, the decision has not been adopted.

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who announced that, under Item 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, during the transitional period of the selection, the Advisory Group of Experts adopts its decisions by at least four votes of its members, at least two of whom have been nominated by international organizations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law.

If, due to an equal number of votes “for” and “against”, the Advisory Group of Experts cannot adopt a decision, a repeated vote shall be held.

Oksana Vasylchenko announced that, given the relevant provisions of the legislation and the equal number of votes “for” and “against” regarding the candidate Olesia Nykon, the Advisory Group of Experts should hold a repeated vote.

Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Olesia Nykon with the criterion of high moral qualities by way of a repeated vote

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, once again proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Olesia Nykon as non-compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Oksana Vasylchenko also announced that, under Item 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, in the event of an equal number of votes “for” and “against” during the repeated vote, the votes of three members of the Advisory Group of



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Experts, at least two of whom have been nominated by international organizations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law, shall be decisive.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “AGAINST”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “AGAINST”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “AGAINST”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

In total: “FOR” – 3 votes, “AGAINST” – 3 votes.

Decided: guided by paragraph three of Item 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Olesia Nykon, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.6. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Vitalii Prydatko with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Vitalii Prydatko as non-compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Vitalii Prydatko, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.7. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Andrii Savchak with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Andrii Savchak as compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Andrii Savchak, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.8. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Petro Saliuk with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Petro Saliuk as compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Petro Saliuk, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, complies with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.9. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Mykhailo Smokovych with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Mykhailo Smokovych as compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "AGAINST"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "AGAINST"

In total: "FOR" – 4 votes, "AGAINST" – 2 votes.

Decided: under paragraph one of Item 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine "On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine", the decision has not been adopted.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

Heard:

Oksana Vasylichenko, who announced that, under paragraph one of Item 20 of Section IV of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, during the transitional period of the selection, the Advisory Group of Experts adopts its decisions by at least four votes of its members, at least two of whom have been nominated by international organizations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law. The candidate received four votes “for”; however, only one of them was cast by a member nominated by international organizations or the European Commission for Democracy through Law.

This situation makes it impossible to adopt a decision on the assessment of the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Mykhailo Smokovych with the criterion of high moral qualities.

At the same time, within the meaning of part 5 of Article 10-8 of the Law of Ukraine “On the Constitutional Court of Ukraine”, only those candidates in respect of whom a decision has been adopted that they “comply” with the criterion of high moral qualities shall be assessed at the next stage of the competitive selection. In view of this, the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Mykhailo Smokovych is not admitted to the assessment of compliance with the criterion of the level of competency in the field of law.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар

Василь Шакун



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

(Aleš Zalar)

(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька

(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко

(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор

(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк

(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.10. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Solotkyi with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Solotkyi as non-compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

In total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Solotkyi, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.11. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Sotnikov with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Sotnikov as non-compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

In total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Serhii Sotnikov, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шақун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

1.12. Adopting the decision on the compliance of the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Tsmokalenko with the criterion of high moral qualities

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, following a discussion with the members of the Advisory Group of Experts, based on the results of the assessment of the high moral qualities of the candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to recognize the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Tsmokalenko as non-compliant with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: "FOR"
- Aleš Zalar: "FOR"
- Vasyl Shakun: "FOR"
- Maureen O'Connor: "FOR"
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: "FOR"
- Hanna Suchocka: "FOR"

In total: "FOR" – 6 votes, "AGAINST" – 0 votes.



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Decided: to rule that the candidate for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine Oksana Tsmokalenko, for the purpose of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of high moral qualities.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О'Коннор
(Maureen O'Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)

Oksana Vasylchenko announced that all agenda items had been considered.

Chair of the Advisory Group of Experts

Oksana Vasylchenko



ADVISORY GROUP OF EXPERTS

Video recording of the session broadcast:

