



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

**MINUTES No. 14
of the session of the Advisory Group of Experts**

*The session has been held in remote mode using electronic
video-conferencing*

December 06, 2024

Start of session: 7:00 p.m.

End of session: 7:21 p.m.

Those present at the session of the members of the Advisory Group of Experts:

*Oksana Vasylychenko, Aleš Zalar, Vasyl Shakun, Maureen O'Connor, Yaroslav Romaniuk,
Hanna Suchocka.*

Deputy members of the Advisory Group of Experts present at the session:

Volodymyr Kuzmenko, Marek Zubik, Thomas Griffith, Vitaly Makhinchuk.

Suggested agenda:

- 1. On conducting additional interviews for assessing the level of the competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.**
- 2. On the assessment of compliance of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine with criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.**
- 3. Miscellaneous.**

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O'Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes.

Decided: the suggested agenda is approved.



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

Consideration of agenda items:

1. On conducting additional interviews for assessing the level of the competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Heard:

Maureen O'Connor, who pointed out that on November 22, 2024, the Advisory Group of Experts conducted a written assignment of the candidates as part of the stage of assessing their level of competence in the field of law and, then, in accordance with the AGE Methodology, within 15 days after the completion of the written assignment of all candidates, the Advisory Group should decide on the need for additional interviews.

Yaroslav Romaniuk and Hanna Suchocka who informed that being acknowledged with the candidates' written answers the Advisory Group of Experts has enough information to continue evaluating the candidates' competence level without conducting additional interviews.

Oksana Vasylchenko who proposed not to conduct additional interviews for assessing the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O'Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

Decided: not to conduct additional interviews for assessing the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

2. On adoption of the decision related to the compliance of all candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

2.1 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

Decided: that Denysenko Nataliia, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

2.2 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Kostenko Vladyslav, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylchenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Kostenko Vladyslav, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylchenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

Decided: that Kostenko Vladyslav, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylchenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

2.3 Adopting a decision related to the compliance of Soldatenko Oksana, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who, based on the results of the comprehensive evaluation of the level of competence in the field of law of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, proposed to deem Soldatenko Oksana, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, as such that does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law.

Voted:

- Oksana Vasylychenko: “FOR”
- Aleš Zalar: “FOR”
- Vasyl Shakun: “FOR”
- Maureen O’Connor: “FOR”
- Yaroslav Romaniuk: “FOR”
- Hanna Suchocka: “FOR”

Total: “FOR” – 6 votes, “AGAINST” – 0 votes

Decided: that Soldatenko Oksana, candidate for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, does not comply with the criterion of the recognized level of competence in the field of law in the framework of the competitive selection of candidates for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine.

Signatures:

Алеш Залар
(Aleš Zalar)

Василь Шакун
(Vasyl Shakun)

Ганна Сухоцька
(Hanna Suchocka)

Оксана Васильченко
(Oksana Vasylychenko)

Морін О’Коннор
(Maureen O’Connor)

Ярослав Романюк
(Yaroslav Romaniuk)



**ДОРАДЧА
ГРУПА ЕКСПЕРТІВ**

3. Miscellaneous.

Heard:

Oksana Vasylychenko, who summarised the results of the competition for the position of a judge of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine, admitted to the competitive selection by the Council of Judges of Ukraine, and noted that the Advisory Group would immediately inform the Council of Judges of Ukraine regarding the need to announce a new competitive selection for such vacant position of the Constitutional Court of Ukraine judge immediately, but not later than twenty days.

Oksana Vasylychenko noted that all issues from the agenda were considered.

**Chairwoman of
the Advisory Group of Experts**

Oksana Vasylychenko

Video recording of the live meeting broadcast:

